



# UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE  
United States Patent and Trademark Office  
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450  
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
-----------------	-------------	----------------------	---------------------	------------------

10/733,584

12/11/2003

Antionietta Grasso

D/A3124

8196

25453

7590

09/06/2006

PATENT DOCUMENTATION CENTER

XEROX CORPORATION

100 CLINTON AVE., SOUTH, XEROX SQUARE, 20TH FLOOR  
ROCHESTER, NY 14644

EXAMINER

LY, CHEYNE D

ART UNIT

PAPER NUMBER

2168

DATE MAILED: 09/06/2006

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

**Office Action Summary**

Application No.

10/733,584

Applicant(s)

GRASSO ET AL.

Examiner

Cheyne D. Ly

Art Unit

2168

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --  
**Period for Reply**

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

**Status**

- 1) ☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on 26 July 2006.
- 2a) ☐ This action is **FINAL**. 2b) ☒ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

**Disposition of Claims**

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 1-5,7-14 and 16-19 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 1-5,7-14 and 16-19 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

**Application Papers**

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☐ The drawing(s) filed on \_\_\_\_\_ is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.  
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).  
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

**Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119**

- 12) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some \* c) ☐ None of:
1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
  2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. \_\_\_\_\_.
  3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

\* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

**Attachment(s)**

- 1) ☒ Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)
- 2) ☐ Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)
- 3) ☐ Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/08)  
Paper No(s)/Mail Date \_\_\_\_\_
- 4) ☐ Interview Summary (PTO-413)  
Paper No(s)/Mail Date. \_\_\_\_\_
- 5) ☐ Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152)
- 6) ☐ Other: \_\_\_\_\_

### DETAILED ACTION

1. The cancellation of claims 6 and 15 are has been acknowledged.
2. Claims 1-5, 7-14, and 16-19 are examined on the merits.
3. The instant **Non-Final Office Action** has been necessitated by the newly cited reference Chang et al. Rejections based on the newly cited reference(s) follow.

### CLAIM REJECTIONS - 35 USC § 102

4. The following is a quotation of the appropriate paragraphs of 35 U.S.C. 102 that form the basis for the rejections under this section made in this Office action:

A person shall be entitled to a patent unless –

(b) the invention was patented or described in a printed publication in this or a foreign country or in public use or on sale in this country, more than one year prior to the date of application for patent in the United States.

5. Claims 1-5, 7-14, and 16-19 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) as being anticipated by Chang et al. (2000) (Chang hereafter).
6. In regard to claim 1, Chang discloses a method for identifying an expert with a community of users in a recommender system (Abstract etc.), comprising:

Identifying items in a particular field provided by users within the community (page 128, column 1, lines 38-42);

For each identified item:

Determining which users within the community have acted upon the identified item (page 127, column 1, last line, to page 128, line 43, especially, section 2. The “Authority” of a Document);

Determining which of the users who have acted upon the identified item are aware of other relevant items in the particular field (page 128, line 1-7); and

Determining which identified items have been acted upon by a predetermined number of hub experts (page 128, column 1, lines 1-6, page 129, column 1, lines 1-9), and

Defining those items as authoritative items;

Wherein the determining steps comprises: "Defining a connectivity matrix M..."

(page 127, column 2, section 2. The "Authority" of a Document, to page 128, column 1, line 42).

7. In regard to claim 2, Chang discloses associating names of the hub experts with the authoritative items (page 128, column 2, lines 20-22, page 129, column 1, lines 1-5).
8. In regard to claim 3, Chang discloses acting upon an item comprises one of reading the item, reviewing the item, commenting on the item and recommending the item (page 128, column 1, lines 1-6).
9. In regard to claim 4, Chang discloses recommending an item comprises submitting a numerical rating (page 129, column 1, lines 6-12).
10. In regard to claim 5, Chang discloses recommending an item comprises submitting a numerical rating and a comment (page 127, column 1, in its entirety, page 130, column 2, section 5.1, page 131, column 2, Figures 2-5).
11. In regard to claims 7-9, Chang discloses the required matrix and parameters (page 128, column 1, in its entirety).
12. In regard to claims 10-14, and 16-19, Chang discloses the claimed invention as cited above.

### CONCLUSION

13. Patent applicants with problems or questions regarding electronic images that can be viewed in the Patent Application Information Retrieval system (PAIR) can now contact the USPTO's Patent Electronic Business Center (Patent EBC) for assistance. Representatives are available to answer your questions daily from 6 am to midnight (EST). The toll free number is (866) 217-9197. When calling please have your application serial or patent number, the type of document you are having an image problem with, the number of pages and the specific nature of the problem. The Patent Electronic Business Center will notify applicants of the resolution of the problem within 5-7 business days. Applicants can also check PAIR to confirm that the problem has been corrected. The USPTO's Patent Electronic Business Center is a complete service center supporting all patent business on the Internet. The USPTO's PAIR system provides Internet-based access to patent application status and history information. It also enables applicants to view the scanned images of their own application file folder(s) as well as general patent information available to the public.
14. For all other customer support, please call the USPTO Call Center (UCC) at 800-786-9199. The USPTO's official fax number is 571-272-8300.
15. Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to C. Dune Ly, whose telephone number is (571) 272-0716. The examiner can normally be reached on Monday-Friday from 8 A.M. to 4 P.M.

Application/Control Number: 10/733,584

Page 5

Art Unit: 2168

16. If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's

supervisor, Tim Vo, can be reached on (571) 272-3642.

C. Dune Ly

Patent Examiner

9/4/06

